

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY



3 1761 10084163 4

CASES AND MATERIALS ON FAMILY LAW

EDITED BY

BERNARD GREEN

SEPTEMBER 1979



The materials produced herein are  
intended for the sole use of law  
students at McGill and Toronto.

CASES AND MATERIALS ON FAMILY LAW

EDITED BY

BERNARD GREEN

SEPTEMBER 1979

VOLUME I

A faint, light-colored watermark of a classical building with four columns and a triangular pediment is visible in the background.

Digitized by the Internet Archive  
in 2018 with funding from  
University of Toronto

[https://archive.org/details/casesmaterialson01gree\\_1](https://archive.org/details/casesmaterialson01gree_1)

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

### GENERAL

	<u>Page</u>
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION .....	2
I    The Constitutional Framework .....	2
II   The Legislative Framework .....	2
III  The Institutional Framework .....	2
A.  The Courts .....	2
B.  Other Agencies .....	2
C.  The Lawyer .....	2
IV   Some Views on Marriage .....	13
CHAPTER TWO: FORMATION OF THE FAMILY UNIT AND ANNULMENT .....	30
I    Introduction .....	30
II   The Constitutional Issue .....	31
III  The Statutory Conditions .....	35
A.  License and Formalities .....	35
B.  Effect of Failure to Comply with Statutory Conditions	38
C.  Age and Parental Consent .....	45
IV   The Conditions Imposed By The Common Law .....	49
A.  Introduction .....	49
B.  A Man and a Woman .....	49
C.  ... Who are Free to Marry .....	57
D.  ... Who Consent to Marry Each Other .....	59
E.  ... And Who Are Able to Consummate the Marriage ...	85
V    Defences To A Nullity Action .....	97
A.  Knowledge .....	97
B.  Conduct .....	102
C.  Delay and Improper Motive .....	110
D.  The Effect of Petitioner's Own Impotence .....	115
VI   The Nullity Decree .....	119
A.  Jurisdiction And Other Matters .....	119
B.  Conflicts Problems .....	120
C.  Economic Consequences .....	120
D.  Children .....	120



	<u>Page</u>
VII Reform: The English Approach .....	121
CHAPTER THREE: DIVORCE .....	129
I    Grounds .....	129
A.    General .....	129
B.    Immediate Relief: The Fault Grounds .....	131
C.    Delayed Relief: Marital Breakdown .....	199
D.    Proposals For Reform .....	244
II   Bars and Defences .....	249
A.    The Possibility of Reconciliation .....	249
B.    Absolute Bars Applicable To All Grounds .....	255
C.    Discretionary Bars .....	266
D.    Special Bars Applicable Only To s. 4 Grounds .....	312
E.    The Problem Of Insanity .....	317
III  Nature And Consequences Of Divorce .....	319
A.    Jurisdiction .....	319
B.    Recognition .....	324
C.    Consequences .....	330
CHAPTER FOUR: ECONOMIC RELATIONS BETWEEN "SPOUSES" .....	332
I    Introduction .....	332
II   Ownership Of Property .....	333c
A.    Introduction .....	333c
B.    The Law Prior to the F.L.R. Act .....	349
C.    The F.L.R. Act .....	386
III  Mutual Duty of Maintenance .....	410
A.    While Married .....	410
B.    On Dissolution of Marriage .....	422
C.    Special Problems: Contracting Out, Welfare and Problems of Federalism .....	485
CHAPTER FIVE: CHILDREN .....	502
I    Introduction .....	502
II   Proving And Disproving Parenthood .....	504

III	Custody .....	510
A.	Private Disputes .....	510
B.	Disputes Involving The State Or A Coercive Agency..	635
C.	Custody And Guardianship After Death Of Natural Guardian .....	690
IV	Access .....	692
V	Adoption .....	698
A.	The Statutory Scheme .....	698
B.	Consent Of Natural Parents .....	705
C.	The Religious Factor .....	716
D.	Access .....	721
VI	The Parent-Child Relationship .....	723
A.	Parental Control .....	723
B.	Economic Relations .....	728
CHAPTER SIX: PROTECTION OF THE FAMILY UNIT AGAINST INTER- FERENCE BY THIRD PARTIES .....		754
I	Between Husband And Wife .....	754
A.	Intentional Interference .....	754
II	Between Parent And Child .....	770

APPENDIX OF STATUTES

	<u>Page</u>
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION .....	2
I The Constitutional Framework .....	2
II The Legislative Framework .....	2
III The Institutional Framework .....	2
A. The courts .....	2
B. Other agencies .....	2
C. The lawyer .....	2
Reisman, Beyond the Call of Obvious Duty .....	3
Freeman and Freeman, Lawyers Cannot Avoid Counselling .....	6
IV Some Views on Marriage .....	13
Rudikoff, Marriage and Household .....	13
Sage, Dissolution of the Family under Swedish Law .....	21
Ryan, Maintenance Obligations in a New Legal Concept of Marriage .....	26
CHAPTER TWO: FORMATION OF THE FAMILY UNIT AND ANNULMENT .....	30
I Introduction .....	30
II The Constitutional Issue .....	31
Kerr .....	31
III The Statutory Conditions .....	35
A. License and formalities .....	35
The Marriage Act, 1977 .....	35
B. Effect of failure to comply with statutory conditions ..	38
The Marriage Act, 1977 .....	38
Friend, "Common Law Marriage in Ontario" .....	38
✓ Alspector .....	42
Friend, "Common Law Marriage in Ontario" .....	43
C. Age and parental consent .....	45
The Marriage Act, 1977 .....	45
Re Fox .....	47
IV The Conditions Imposed By The Common Law .....	49
A. Introduction .....	49
B. A man and a woman ... .....	49
Baker v. Nelson .....	49
North v. Matheson .....	51
M.T. v. J.T. .....	54
C. ... Who are free to marry ... .....	57
✓ Re Perry .....	57
The Marriage Act, 1977 .....	58



	<u>Page</u>
D. ... who consent to marry each other . . . . .	59
(1) Mental capacity . . . . .	59
The Marriage Act, 1977 . . . . .	59
Chertkow v. Feinstein . . . . .	60
Whitaker v. McNeilly . . . . .	67
(2) Mistake as to the nature of the ceremony . . . . .	70
• Nane v. Sykiotis . . . . .	70
(3) Mental reservations . . . . .	73
• Gardner . . . . .	73
(4) Duress . . . . .	75
✓ Thompson . . . . .	75
(5) Fraud . . . . .	80
✓ Moss . . . . .	80
H. v. C. . . . .	83
E. ... and who are able to consummate the marriage . . . . .	85
(1) What constitutes consummation . . . . .	85
✓ Baxter . . . . .	85
✓ Wilkinson . . . . .	88
(2) Inability to consummate . . . . .	90
(a) Physical . . . . .	90
Foster . . . . .	90
(b) "Invincible repugnance" . . . . .	92
✓ Heil . . . . .	92
✓ Greenlees . . . . .	94
✓ Foisy . . . . .	95
V Defences To A Nullity Action . . . . .	97
A. Knowledge . . . . .	97
✓ G. v. G. . . . .	97
✓ B. v. B. . . . .	101
B. Conduct . . . . .	102
✓ R.E.L. . . . .	102
✓ W. v. W. . . . .	107
C. Delay and improper motive . . . . .	110
Clifford . . . . .	110
J. v. J. . . . .	114
D. The effect of petitioner's own impotence . . . . .	115
✓ Pettit . . . . .	115
VI The Nullity Decree . . . . .	119
A. Jurisdiction and other matters . . . . .	119
The Annulment of Marriages Act . . . . .	119
✓ Rose . . . . .	119

	<u>Page</u>
B. Conflicts problems .....	120
C. Economic consequences .....	120
D. Children .....	120
VII Reform: The English Approach .....	121
<i>Gretney, "The Nullity of Marriage Act 1971"</i> .....	121
CHAPTER THREE: DIVORCE .....	129
I Grounds .....	129
A. General .....	129
<i>Green, "The Divorce Act of 1968"</i> .....	129
<i>Divorce Act</i> .....	130
B. Immediate relief: the fault grounds .....	131
(1) Adultery .....	131
(a) What it is .....	131
<i>Orford</i> .....	131
<i>Dennis</i> .....	133
(b) Proving adultery .....	134
(i) Standard of proof .....	134
<i>Smith</i> .....	134
(ii) Methods .....	134
1. Physical condition .....	134
<i>M. v. M.</i> .....	134
<i>Preston-Jones</i> .....	136
<i>Himmelman</i> .....	138
2. Circumstances .....	140
<i>Downie</i> .....	140
<i>Little</i> .....	143
3. Admissions .....	147
<i>Divorce Act</i> .....	147
<i>The Evidence Act</i> .....	147
<i>Ewasuk</i> .....	148
<i>Veysey</i> .....	149
<i>Rosen, "The Privilege Against Self-Incrimination as to Adultery - Should It Be Abolished?"</i> .....	150
<i>Rayner</i> .....	152
<i>Hunter</i> .....	152
4. Other decrees .....	153
<i>Love</i> .....	153
<i>Meshwa</i> .....	155
(2) Other sexual misconduct .....	157
<i>Divorce Act</i> .....	157
<i>G. v. G.</i> .....	158
<i>M. v. M.</i> .....	160
<i>T. v. T. and W.</i> .....	161

	<u>Page</u>
(3) Cruelty .....	163
Divorce Act .....	164
(a) Relevance of the common law alimony standard ...	164
N. v. N. ....	164
(b) Grave and weighty conduct .....	169
- Knoll .....	169
Feldman .....	169
Wittstock .....	171
Shumila .....	175
- Hattie .....	178
(c) The relevance of intention .....	179
- Gollins .....	179
- Anderson .....	193
(d) Mutual cruelty .....	196
Kelly .....	196
(e) The time problem .....	198
C. Delayed relief: marital breakdown .....	199
Divorce Act .....	199
(1) "Separate and apart" ... .....	201
J.B. v. A.W.B. ....	201
Deslippe .....	205
Boechler .....	206
Dorchester .....	208
- Lachman .....	209
(2) Deserion .....	213
(a) Without just cause .....	213
Nutley .....	213
Sullivan .....	215
- Struk .....	218
- G. v. G. ....	219
- Bird .....	222
Marsden .....	224
Slon .....	226
(b) "...and with the intention to remain apart permanently ..." .....	228
Lilley .....	228
Kaczmarz .....	232
(c) the problem of mutual desertion .....	235
Price .....	235
(d) termination of desertion .....	238
Digiacinto .....	238
- Richards .....	239
March .....	241
Gushta .....	242

	<u>Page</u>
D. Proposals for reform .....	244
Goldstein & Gitter, On Abolition of Grounds for Divorce .....	244
II Bars and Defences .....	249
A. The possibility of reconciliation .....	249
Divorce Act .....	249
Irving & Irving, Conciliation Counselling In Divorce Litigation .....	250
B. Absolute bars applicable to all grounds .....	255
(1) Collusion .....	255
Divorce Act .....	255
Sopinka, "The Divorce Act 1968, Collusion Confined" ..	256
(2) Fraud .....	263
Fromovitz .....	263
C. Discretionary bars .....	266
(1) Connivance .....	266
Divorce Act .....	266
Berger .....	267
(a) Consent .....	268
Rumbelow .....	268
T. v. T. .....	270
(b) Passive acquiescence: investigation .....	272
Pearl .....	272
Hechter .....	273
(c) Termination of connivance .....	278
Godfrey .....	278
(2) Condonation .....	280
(a) Introduction .....	280
Divorce Act .....	281
(b) The common law .....	282
(i) Knowledge, forgiveness and re-instatement ..	282
Leaderhouse .....	282
Douglas .....	287
Bateman v. Bateman .....	288
Vance .....	289
Henderson .....	294
(c) The effect of the Divorce Act .....	297
Divorce Act .....	297
Cherinski .....	297
Boivert v. Marineau .....	298
Armstrong .....	301
Blackburn .....	303
Brown .....	304
Blue .....	308

	<u>Page</u>
(3) The exercise of discretion .....	309
Divorce Act .....	309
Blunt .....	310
D. Special bars applicable only to s. 4 grounds .....	312
Divorce Act .....	312
Raggett .....	313
Savage .....	315
E. The problem of insanity .....	317
B. v. B. .....	317
III Nature and Consequences of Divorce .....	319
A. Jurisdiction .....	319
Divorce Act .....	319
Mendes da Costa, Some Comments on the Conflict of Laws Provisions of the Divorce Act, 1968 .....	320
B. Recognition .....	324
Divorce Act .....	324
Mendes da Costa, Some Comments on the Conflict of Laws Provisions of the Divorce Act, 1968 .....	324
C. Consequences .....	330
(1) Status .....	330
Divorce Act .....	330
(2) Economic: see Chapter Four .....	331
(3) Children: see Chapter Five .....	331
CHAPTER FOUR: ECONOMIC RELATIONS BETWEEN "SPOUSES" .....	332
I. Introduction .....	332
Zuijdwijk, A Note on the Standard Matrimonial Property Regime in Quebec .....	333
II Ownership of Property .....	333c
A. Introduction .....	333c
Friedman, A Comparative Analysis .....	333c
Law Reform Commission of Canada .....	339
B. The Law Prior to the F.L.R. Act .....	349
<sup>1</sup> Gissing .....	349
Murdoch .....	359
Rathwell .....	368
Becker v. Pettkus .....	378
Marvin .....	382
C. The F.L.R. Act .....	386
(1) Provisions applicable to determining ownership of all types of assets .....	386

	<u>Page</u>
(2) Provisions concerning family assets .....	388
(a) What is a family asset .....	388
(b) Powers of court in relation to family assets and other types of property .....	390
(3) Provisions relating to the matrimonial home .....	392
(a) What is the matrimonial home .....	392
(b) Consequences of finding that property is a matrimonial home .....	393
Silverstein .....	395